
From: Isaac, Graham [DPYGB]
To: Plouhar, Pam [DPYUS]; Flett, Magnus [DPYGB]; Newell, Ian [DPYGB]; Ryan, Scott [DPYUS];
Myers, Simon [DPYGB]; Barker, Michael [DPYUS]
Sent: 5/4/2010 3:32:22 PM
Subject: FW: ASR

Dear All,

You should be aware of this email from David Beverland. There are a number of issues which I will try and address over the telephone

Regards

Graham

-----Original Message-----

From: Beverland, David [mailto:david.beverland@belfasttrust.hscni.net]
Sent: 04 May 2010 06:32
To: Isaac, Graham [DPYGB]
Subject: ASR

Hi Graham

I had a long phone call tonight from Tony Nargol

He phoned me because he heard I had been having problems with the ASR. I had of course heard of him and knew he had metal on metal problems but not that he had been using the ASR.

He told me that you are going up to see him on Thursday

It was interesting just to compare our experiences

He like us has had far more problems with ASR and Corail or SRom than with ASR resurfacing

He now has 17% failure with Corail ASR almost identical to ours - again like us problems with the cup and stem - again like us some loose stems but he wasn't aware of whether or not the stems had been high offset - although we have loose Standard stems with ASR as well as the high offset

The other thing he told me was that they also had had some failures with Corail Pinnacle with metal on metal, metal on ceramic and I think he said ceramic on ceramic as well. He thinks that virtually all of these have arisen since they started to Pinnacle with HA coating. He was saying that his histopathologist says that the appearances of the Pinnacle failures are very different.

As you perhaps know I am involved in the Depuy investigation into the Duofix femur problems. We had a telephone conference last week with Cath Hardaker among others. The reported failure rate of the Duofix femur is 0.67%. I was asking why Depuy have put such a huge effort into this Duofix femur problem. I was saying that I wished my ASR problems were 0.67%!!

Anyway the problem with the Duofix femur appears to be the HA coating. Apparently there are similarities between the HA coating on the ASR and the Duofix femur. I asked during the telephone conference about ASR but there seems to have been very little communication between the hip and knee teams in Depuy about this issue. During the telephone conference there was a histopathologist speaking - I forget her name something like Marika - I think it would be interesting for her to see some of the specimens from ASR failures but perhaps even more so the Pinnacle failures of Tony Nargol's which only appeared after the introduction of HA Pinnacle.

Clearly now there are specific design problems with the ASR and that may explain all

BUT what if any significance has the HA coating both for ASR and Pinnacle

What is the connection with Corail high offset and ASR

Is the Corail high offset stem on its own a problem - Depuy have really been slow to take this forward for me - Jens was supposed to see a French series a year ago

I am also still concerned about my Metal on Ceramic patients and I am wondering if I should now recall all of them and do their metal ions. Tony has just done this but has no results as yet

Also we have number of patients with raised metal ion levels whose MRI is normal and their pain is ok or mild - Tony says for these patients it is just a matter of time before they fail

All in all this ASR problem has to date been the worst problem I have faced in my surgical career - it has been a real nightmare - I am still seeing at least one patient for revision at every problem clinic. It was a relief to speak to someone like Tony who has been having similar problems. As you know BART paid for all the metal ion blood tests and all the additional clinics we held to review the 153 ASR patients. If I had waited until now and the MHRA announcement the Hospital would probably have paid. I think now with the MHRA announcement I will try and avoid having to pay for all the MRI scans - the bill for them so far is £36,000.

We are having a further update in Belfast on our ASR results on Thursday I will let you know the outcome of our meeting.

On a happier note

We have put a lot more work into the calliper project would be keen to get you over soon to discuss

In the next few weeks what Thursdays do you have free? Apart from the 20th and 27th when I am in Annecy and Rome at hip meetings - maybe you are at the Rome meeting as well.

Best wishes

David

